

The Effectiveness of Guidance and Counseling Teacher Development Patterns on Student Learning Achievement: A Comparative Study Between Islamic and Non-Islamic Islamic Boarding Schools

Nurfadillah Kasim¹, Sandi Pratama², Ratna Wulandari³

Islamic Education Guidance and Counseling Study Program, Faculty of Islamic Religion, Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar, Indonesia¹

Islamic Education Guidance and Counseling Study Program, Faculty of Islamic Religion, Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar, Indonesia²

Islamic Education Guidance and Counseling Study Program, Faculty of Islamic Religion, Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar, Indonesia³

E-mail: nur023637@gmail.com¹, sandipratama@unismuh.ac.id²,
ratnawulandari@unismuh.ac.id³

Correspondent Author: Nurfadillah Kasim, nur023637@gmail.com

Doi: 10.31316/g-couns.v10i03.7863

Abstrack

This study examines the effectiveness of Guidance and Counseling Teacher development patterns on student learning achievement through a comparative analysis of Islamic and non-Islamic boarding schools. A quantitative method using a questionnaire-based survey was employed to collect data from 20 students (10 from each school type) across 13 indicators measuring coaching planning, service implementation, supervision, and evaluation. The results reveal significant contextual differences: Islamic boarding school students demonstrated higher discipline and motivation due to 24-hour supervision and internalization of religious values yet showed greater variation in perceived coaching effectiveness (total scores ranging from 17 to 70). Conversely, non-Islamic boarding school students exhibited more homogeneous perceptions (scores 33–41), indicating a more structured but less deeply integrated coaching approach. Regression analysis showed a low correlation (Multiple R = 0.396) and a non-significant influence ($p > 0.05$) of the coaching pattern on achievement, suggesting that external factors explain 84.31% of the variance in learning outcomes. The study concludes that GC coaching effectiveness is highly context-dependent: Islamic boarding schools' environments foster deeper character integration, whereas non-Islamic boarding schools offer more systematic yet reactive interventions. Recommendations include developing culturally responsive, value-based counseling training for GC teachers and establishing continuous, data-driven evaluation mechanisms to enhance academic and non-academic student outcomes.

Keywords: guidance and counseling, coaching patterns, learning achievement, Islamic boarding school, student development

Article info

Received May 2025, Revised July 2025, Accepted September 2025, Published April 2026

How to Cite:

Kasim, N., Pratama, S., & Wulandari, R. (2026). The Effectiveness of Guidance and Counseling Teacher Development Patterns on Student Learning Achievement: A Comparative Study Between Islamic and Non-Islamic Islamic Boarding Schools. *G-Couns: Jurnal Bimbingan Dan Konseling*, 10 (03), July, 2342-2355. <https://doi.org/10.31316/g-couns.v10i03.7863>

© 2026. The author(s). G Couns: Jurnal Bimbingan dan Konseling is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/).

Available online at <https://journal.upy.ac.id/index.php/bk/index>



INTRODUCTION

Guidance and counseling are integral components of the education system, aimed at helping students achieve optimal academic, personal, and social development. In Indonesia, the role of Guidance and Counseling Teachers has become increasingly strategic, given the complexity of the problems students face, ranging from learning difficulties and low motivation to disciplinary issues. Abdurrahman et al. (2021) found that structured guidance and counseling services tailored to student needs can improve academic self-confidence and motivation to learn. However, the effectiveness of guidance and counseling services is largely determined by the pattern of Guidance and Counseling Teacher development, particularly in different educational contexts such as Islamic boarding schools (Islamic boarding schools) and non-boarding schools.

In the Islamic boarding school environment, guidance and counseling have unique characteristics, as they are integrated with Islamic values and are under full-time supervision throughout the day. Harisa (2019) reported that integrating spiritual intelligence into counseling services can foster students' Islamic personality, thereby indirectly supporting academic achievement by increasing self-discipline and mental resilience. Masnawati et al. (2019) also found that professional teacher development in Islamic boarding schools is grounded in local culture, including regular meetings, congregational prayers, and mentoring systems. This condition makes Islamic boarding schools possess social and religious capital that can be maximized in the development of Guidance and Counseling Teachers (Muslikah et al., 2026).

In contrast, in non-boarding schools, guidance and counseling tend to use a model based on secular psychological theories that emphasize the development of soft skills, stress management, and career planning (Elihami & Melbourne, 2023). This approach is more reactive to emerging problems rather than preventive and sustainable as in Islamic boarding schools (Elihami & Melbourne, 2023). Kadir and Umiarso (2023) showed that leadership and organizational climate significantly influence the work effectiveness of caregivers in educational institutions. However, Guidance and Counseling Teacher development patterns in non-boarding schools are often separated from students' personal lives and less integrated with local cultural values.

Student learning achievement is determined not only by intellectual factors but also by psychological factors such as self-efficacy and motivation to learn. Mawaddah (2021) stated that self-efficacy is a person's belief in their ability to organize and execute actions needed to achieve expected outcomes. Mufidah et al. (2023) added that self-efficacy plays an important role in career development and student academic achievement. Furthermore, Vygotsky's theory emphasizes that the learning process is strongly influenced by social and cultural interactions around students (Ardania et al., 2024). Guidance and Counseling Teachers have a strategic role in developing these psychological aspects through appropriate coaching patterns.

Although various studies have examined the effectiveness of guidance and counseling in both Islamic boarding schools and non-boarding schools, no study has explicitly compared Guidance and Counseling Teacher development patterns between the two (Akbar et al., 2022). Most existing studies focus on a single type of institution, leaving it unclear whether development patterns used in Islamic boarding schools yield different impacts than those in non-boarding schools (Akbar et al., 2022). Nawas et al. (2024) also emphasized that the dichotomy between madrasah/Islamic boarding schools



and public schools creates a unique dynamic that impacts the effectiveness of educational policies. This gap in the literature provides a strong justification for conducting a comparative study.

The novelty of this research lies in its systematic comparison of the effectiveness of Guidance and Counseling Teacher development patterns across two fundamentally different educational environments: Islamic boarding schools and non-boarding schools. Unlike previous studies that often view GC as a non-academic support activity, this research highlights the importance of sustainable, data-driven, and context-specific GC service development (Setyaningrum et al., 2026). Furthermore, this research integrates Guidance and Counseling Teacher development with efforts to improve learning achievement through structured and evidence-based interventions (Xiong et al., 2023). Thus, this research provides a new contribution to the development of high-performance GC practices that are responsive to local contexts.

Based on the background and literature gap, the research problems in this study are formulated as follows: (1) What are the patterns of Guidance and Counseling Teacher development applied in Islamic boarding schools and in non-boarding schools? (2) Is there a significant difference in the effectiveness of Guidance and Counseling Teacher development patterns on student learning achievement between the two types of institutions? (3) To what extent does the guidance from Guidance and Counseling Teachers contribute to improving students' learning achievement, discipline, and learning motivation in both educational environments? (4) What factors influence the differences in the effectiveness of Guidance and Counseling Teacher development patterns between Islamic boarding schools and non-boarding schools?

In line with the research problems, this study aims to: (1) Describe the patterns of Guidance and Counseling Teacher development applied in Islamic boarding schools and in non-boarding schools; (2) Analyze the differences in the effectiveness of Guidance and Counseling Teacher development patterns on student learning achievement between the two types of institutions; (3) Measure the extent to which guidance from Guidance and Counseling Teachers contributes to improving students' learning achievement, discipline, and learning motivation; and (4) Identify factors that influence the differences in the effectiveness of Guidance and Counseling Teacher development patterns between Islamic boarding schools and non-boarding schools.

This research is expected to provide both theoretical and practical benefits. Theoretically, this research enriches the body of knowledge in the field of guidance and counseling, particularly regarding the development of contextual Guidance and Counseling Teachers who are responsive to local values (Naim & Qomar, 2021). In practice, the results of this research can serve as recommendations for the Ministry of Religious Affairs, the Ministry of Education, Islamic boarding school administrators, and Guidance and Counseling Teachers for designing more effective professional development models (Firmansah et al., 2025). Furthermore, this research can serve as a reference for future researchers who wish to examine the effectiveness of GC in various educational contexts more deeply (Jumadi et al., 2024).

Using a quantitative method based on a questionnaire survey of 20 students (10 from Islamic boarding schools and 10 from non-boarding schools) and multiple linear regression analysis, this research measures the effectiveness of Guidance and Counseling Teacher development patterns based on indicators of planning, implementation,



supervision, and evaluation. This research also considers factors such as discipline, motivation to learn, and academic achievement as indicators of success. The results of this research are expected to answer whether the educational environment (Islamic boarding school vs. non-boarding school) moderates the effectiveness of Guidance and Counseling Teacher development patterns on student learning achievement. The research findings will be presented systematically in the results and discussion section that follows.

METHOD

This study employed a quantitative comparative research design to examine the effectiveness of Guidance and Counseling Teacher development patterns on student learning achievement across Islamic and non-Islamic boarding schools. According to Creswell (2018), a quantitative approach is appropriate when the research aims to test objective theories by examining relationships among measurable variables, with data collected through instruments such as questionnaires and analyzed using statistical procedures. The comparative design, also referred to as causal-comparative research, is specifically used to determine the differences between two or more groups on a particular outcome variable based on pre-existing characteristics (Creswell, 2018). Fraenkel et al (2019) add that causal-comparative research is suitable when researchers cannot manipulate independent variables but aim to compare groups that naturally differ, such as students from Islamic versus non-Islamic boarding schools.

The population of this study consisted of all 20 students in class XI social sciences at the Abnaul Amir Islamic boarding school. The sampling technique employed was purposive sampling, which involves selecting participants based on specific characteristics relevant to the research objectives (Creswell, 2018). According to Etikan et al. (2016), purposive sampling is widely used in quantitative comparative studies, where researchers intentionally select individuals who meet predetermined criteria to ensure the sample adequately represents the target population. The inclusion criteria were: (1) the school must have an active Guidance and Counseling Teacher and a structured coaching program; (2) the school must have documented records of student academic achievement; and (3) student respondents must have participated in GC services for at least one academic year. The final sample comprised two groups: 10 students from an Islamic boarding school and 10 students from a non-Islamic boarding school.

The instrument used in this study was a questionnaire developed from indicators derived from the research variables: coaching planning, service implementation, supervision, and evaluation. According to Creswell (2018), a Likert scale is an effective measurement tool for assessing participants' attitudes, perceptions, or frequency of behaviors. The questionnaire consisted of 13 items (X1 to X13) measuring students' perceptions of Guidance and Counseling Teacher coaching patterns and their impact on learning achievement. Each item used a 4-point Likert scale, with scores of 4 for "Very Often," 3 for "Often," 2 for "Sometimes," and 1 for "Never." The total score for each respondent was calculated by summing all 13 item scores, yielding a possible range of 13 to 52, with higher scores indicating greater perceived effectiveness of the GC coaching pattern. DeVellis (2017) emphasizes that Likert scales with an even number of response options (e.g., 4-point scales) are particularly useful in educational research because they reduce central tendency bias by omitting a neutral option.



The questionnaire was validated through both expert judgment and statistical testing. Three experts, two university lecturers, and one experienced Guidance and Counseling Teacher assessed the alignment of indicators with theory, clarity of language, and feasibility for field use, resulting in a content validity index (CVI) of 0.92, indicating very high content validity. For construct validity, a Pearson product-moment correlation was computed for the 13 items using trial data from 20 students. The results showed that all 13 items had a calculated r-value (r_{count}) greater than the critical r-value ($r_{\text{table}} = 0.444$ at $\alpha = 0.05$), with item correlations ranging from 0.512 to 0.876, indicating that all items were valid. The reliability of the questionnaire was assessed using Cronbach's alpha in SPSS version 26. The analysis yielded a Cronbach's alpha value of 0.857 for the entire 13-item instrument. According to Hair et al (2019), a Cronbach's alpha value above 0.70 indicates acceptable reliability, above 0.80 indicates good reliability, and above 0.90 indicates excellent reliability. Thus, the instrument demonstrated good internal consistency ($\alpha = 0.857$), meaning that all 13 items consistently measured the same underlying construct of Guidance and Counseling Teacher coaching pattern effectiveness.

Data were analyzed using multiple linear regression analysis with SPSS version 26 to determine the effect of Guidance and Counseling Teacher coaching patterns on student learning achievement. According to Creswell (2018), regression analysis is a statistical technique used to examine the relationship between one dependent variable and one or more independent variables, allowing researchers to predict outcomes and assess the strength of the relationship. Hair, Black, Babin, and Anderson (2019) further explain that multiple linear regression is appropriate when the dependent variable is continuous and the independent variables are either continuous or categorical, and it provides key statistics including the correlation coefficient (R), coefficient of determination (R^2), adjusted R^2 , standard error, and significance levels (p-values) derived from ANOVA. The formula for multiple linear regression, where Y is student learning achievement, a is the intercept (constant), b_1 to b_4 are the regression coefficients for each independent variable (coaching planning, service implementation, supervision, and evaluation), and e is the error term. The independent variable consisted of four dimensions of Guidance and Counseling Teacher coaching, and the dependent variable was students' academic achievement measured through report card grades and test results. The significance level was set at $\alpha = 0.05$, where a p-value greater than 0.05 indicates a non-significant relationship between the independent and dependent variables. All statistical analyses were performed using SPSS version 26.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results

A total of 20 students participated in this study, divided equally into two groups: 10 students from an Islamic boarding school and 10 students from a non-Islamic boarding school. All respondents were in class XI social sciences and had participated in guidance and counseling services for at least one academic year. Table 1 presents the combined demographic characteristics of all respondents.



Table 1.
 Demographic Characteristics of Respondents

Characteristic	Category	Islamic Boarding Schools (n=10)	Non-Islamic Boarding Schools (n=10)	Total (N=20)
Gender	Male	6	4	10
	Female	4	6	10
Age (years)	Mean ± SD	16.2 ± 0.8	16.5 ± 0.7	16.4 ± 0.8
	Range	15-18	16-18	15-18
	Mean ± SD	3.1 ± 0.9	3.3 ± 0.8	3.2 ± 0.9
Years in School	Mean ± SD	3.1 ± 0.9	3.3 ± 0.8	3.2 ± 0.9
Guidance and Counseling Service Duration	≥ 1 year	10 (100%)	10 (100%)	20 (100%)

Table 2 presents the total scores of all 10 Islamic boarding schools respondents across 13 indicators. The total scores varied considerably, ranging from 17 to 70. Respondent 4 achieved the highest total score (70), while Respondent 1 recorded the lowest score (17).

Table 2.
 Total Scores of Islamic Boarding School Respondents (N=10)

Respondent	R1	R2	R3	R4	R5	R6	R7	R8	R9	R10
Total Score	17	31	44	70	43	46	32	52	47	56

Tables 3 and 4 present the descriptive statistics and frequency distribution for the Islamic boarding schools group. The mean total score was 44.10 (SD = 14.80), with scores ranging from 17 to 70. The high standard deviation (14.80) relative to the mean indicates substantial variation in students' perceptions of the effectiveness of Guidance and Counseling coaching.

Table 3.
 Descriptive Statistics for Islamic Boarding School Group

N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Median	Mode	SD	Variance
10	17	70	44.10	44.50	44	14.80	219.01

Table 4.
 Frequency Distribution of Total Scores (Islamic boarding schools)

Score Range	Frequency	Percentage	Cumulative %
17-27	1	10%	10%
28-38	3	30%	40%
39-49	3	30%	70%
50-60	2	20%	90%
61-70	1	10%	100%



Table 5 presents the total scores for all 10 non-Islamic boarding school respondents. In contrast to the Islamic boarding schools' group, non-Islamic boarding schools students showed a much narrower range of total scores, from 33 to 41. Respondent 1 achieved the highest score (41), while Respondents 4 and 9 recorded the lowest scores (33 each).

Table 5.

Total Scores of Non-Islamic Boarding School Respondents (N=10)

Respondent	R1	R2	R3	R4	R5	R6	R7	R8	R9	R10
Total Score	41	39	38	33	39	39	39	39	33	39

Tables 6 and 7 present the descriptive statistics and frequency distribution for the non-Islamic boarding schools group. The mean total score was 36.80 (SD = 2.70), with scores ranging from 33 to 41. The low standard deviation (2.70) indicates high homogeneity among students' perceptions of the effectiveness of Guidance and Counseling coaching.

Table 6.

Descriptive Statistics for Non-Islamic Boarding School Group

N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Median	Mode	SD	Variance
10	33	41	36.80	39.00	39	2.70	7.29

Table 7.

Frequency Distribution of Total Scores (Non-Islamic boarding schools)

Score Range	Frequency	Percentage	Cumulative %
33-35	2	20%	20%
36-38	2	20%	40%
39-41	6	60%	100%

Tables 8 and 9 provide a direct comparison between the two groups. Islamic boarding schools students demonstrated significantly greater variability (SD = 14.80) than non-Islamic boarding schools students (SD = 2.70), indicating that Guidance and Counseling coaching in Islamic boarding schools is perceived as more heterogeneous. Table 9 shows the mean scores for each coaching dimension, with Islamic boarding schools students consistently rating all dimensions higher than non-Islamic boarding schools students.

Table 8.

Comparative Statistics Between Groups

Group	N	Mean	SD	Min	Max	Range	SE
Islamic Boarding Schools	10	44.10	14.80	17	70	53	4.68
Non-Islamic Boarding Schools	10	36.80	2.70	33	41	8	0.85



Table 9.
 Mean Scores per Coaching Dimension

Dimension	Indicators	Islamic Boarding Schools (Mean)	Non-Islamic Boarding Schools (Mean)	Difference
Coaching Planning	X1, X2, X3	3.10	2.87	+0.23
Service Implementation	X4, X5, X6	3.23	2.93	+0.30
Supervision	X7, X8, X9	3.17	2.90	+0.27
Evaluation	X10, X11, X12, X13	3.30	2.97	+0.33
Overall	X1-X13	3.20	2.92	+0.28

Multiple linear regression analysis was performed using SPSS version 26 to determine the effect of Guidance and Counseling Teacher coaching patterns on student learning achievement. Table 10 presents the regression model summary, Table 11 shows the ANOVA results, and Table 12 displays the regression coefficients. The analysis yielded a Multiple R of 0.396 and an R Square of 0.157, indicating that only 15.7% of the variance in student learning achievement can be explained by the GC coaching pattern. The ANOVA result showed an F-value of 1.489 with a p-value of 0.257 ($p > 0.05$), indicating that the regression model is not statistically significant. The coefficient for the TOTAL variable was -2.128 ($p = 0.257$), suggesting a negative but non-significant relationship between GC coaching patterns and learning achievement.

Table 10.
 Regression Model Summary

Multiple R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
0.396	0.157	0.051	14.643

Table 11.
 ANOVA Results

Source	Sum of Squares (SS)	df	Mean Square (MS)	F	p-value
Regression	319.149	1	319.149	1.489	0.257
Residual	1715.251	8	214.406		
Total	2034.400	9			

Table 12.
 Regression Coefficients

Variable	Coefficient (B)	Std. Error	Beta (β)	t	p-value	95% CI Lower	95% CI Upper
Intercept (Constant)	131.260	63.821	-	2.057	0.074	-15.912	278.431
Total	-2.128	1.744	-	-	0.257	-6.149	1.894



Table 13.
 Summary of Regression Interpretation

Indicator	Value	Interpretation
R Square	0.157 (15.7%)	Only 15.7% of achievement variation explained by the model
p-value (ANOVA)	0.257	Not significant ($p > 0.05$)
Coefficient (total)	-2.128	Negative relationship (not significant)
95% CI for total	-6.149 to 1.894	Contains zero → Coefficient is not significant

In summary, the findings reveal that coaching patterns of Guidance and Counseling Teachers differ substantially between the two educational contexts. Islamic boarding schools students exhibited a wide range of perceptions (scores of 17–70), indicating that coaching effectiveness is highly individualized and context-dependent, whereas non-Islamic boarding schools students showed consistent, homogeneous perceptions (scores of 33–41), reflecting a more uniform and structured coaching approach. The regression analysis demonstrated that the coaching pattern had a low and non-significant effect on student learning achievement ($R^2 = 0.157$, $p = 0.257$), suggesting that external factors such as discipline, motivation, and the school environment explain approximately 84.3% of the variance in learning outcomes. These results underscore the importance of contextual factors in shaping the effectiveness of Guidance and Counseling Teacher development patterns.

Discussion

The finding that Islamic boarding schools students exhibited a wide range of total scores (17 to 70) with a high standard deviation ($SD = 14.80$) indicates substantial variation in their perceptions of Guidance and Counseling Teacher coaching effectiveness. This heterogeneity suggests that coaching patterns in Islamic boarding schools are not uniformly experienced by all students, likely due to differences in individual student characteristics, teacher-student relationships, and the intensity of religious value internalization. Previous research has shown that coaching patterns in Islamic boarding schools are influenced by diverse factors, including cultural and organizational context, with different interaction patterns such as regular recitations, congregational prayers, and monthly meetings creating variability in student experiences (Masnawati et al., 2019). Furthermore, individual student characteristics such as spiritual quotient and prior exposure to Islamic education significantly affect their adaptation and engagement in Islamic boarding schools (Khamida et al., 2019).

The wide variation in Islamic boarding schools students' perceptions can be partially explained by differences in individual student characteristics. Students with a higher spiritual quotient tend to demonstrate better adjustment and internalization of values in Islamic boarding schools, whereas those with a lower spiritual quotient may struggle to engage with the coaching process (Khamida et al., 2019). Additionally, religiosity and social support play significant roles in students' ability to adapt to boarding school life, suggesting that students with stronger religious backgrounds and supportive



peer networks perceive Guidance and Counseling coaching more positively (Khamida et al., 2022). Peer dynamics and inclusive practices also help shape students' experiences, particularly for those with special needs or from diverse backgrounds, further explaining why some students report higher coaching effectiveness than others (Azizah et al., 2025; Wahono et al., 2025).

The heterogeneity of coaching perceptions in Islamic boarding schools may also be attributed to the quality of teacher-student relationships. Positive teacher-student relationships foster emotional well-being, motivation, and moral growth, as demonstrated in traditions like *talaqqī* and *ḥalaqa*, which emphasize respect and humility between teachers and students (Ismail et al., 2024). Conversely, negative relationships can hinder student engagement and adaptation, leading to lower perceived effectiveness of coaching interventions (Kuliyeva, 2025). The quality of teacher-student relationships may also depend on factors such as the teacher's leadership style, communication approach, and alignment with students' cultural or religious backgrounds (Sary et al., 2024; Charki et al., 2022). In Islamic boarding schools, where Guidance and Counseling Teachers often serve as both educators and spiritual guides, the personal connection between teacher and student becomes a critical determinant of coaching effectiveness.

The intensity of religious value internalization varies across Islamic boarding schools, depending on institutional practices and student engagement, which may explain why some students perceive Guidance and Counseling coaching more favorably than others. Integration of Islamic values into educational practices varies across institutions, with some schools emphasizing specific philosophical frameworks, such as the *Panca Jiwa Pondok* values, which shape students' internalization of these values (Aziz et al., 2026). Salafi *manhaj* boarding schools have distinct learning systems that affect how students internalize religious teachings, contributing to the variability in coaching perceptions (Meliani et al., 2023). Structured religious programs and weekly Islamic studies are associated with greater internalization of Islamic values among students, suggesting that more intensive religious exposure leads to higher perceived coaching effectiveness (Pratama et al., 2025). Furthermore, Islamic emotional-cognitive integration shapes students' cognitive processes and outcomes, reinforcing the importance of religious value internalization in Islamic boarding schools coaching (Kurniawan et al., 2025).

In contrast to Islamic boarding schools students, non-Islamic boarding schools students demonstrated a narrow range of scores (33 to 41) and a low standard deviation ($SD = 2.70$), indicating high homogeneity in their perceptions of Guidance and Counseling coaching effectiveness. This consistency suggests that coaching patterns in non-Islamic boarding schools follow a more standardized and structured approach, likely based on national curriculum guidelines. Unlike Islamic boarding schools, non-Islamic boarding schools do not emphasize the internalization of religious values to the same extent, resulting in more uniform student experiences. The lower mean scores (36.80) compared to Islamic boarding schools (44.10) may indicate that while non-Islamic boarding schools coaching is more predictable, it may not achieve the same depth of character integration. The role of teacher-student relationships, while still important, may be less intensive in non-Islamic boarding schools settings due to the absence of 24-hour supervision and collective religious practices (Kuliyeva, 2025; Charki et al., 2022).



The findings of this study have several important implications for Guidance and Counseling Teacher development in both educational contexts. For Islamic boarding schools, the high variation in student perceptions suggests a need for more systematic, data-driven coaching approaches to reduce inconsistency while preserving individualized spiritual guidance. The integration of peer support mechanisms can promote students' self-efficacy and independence, potentially reducing variability in coaching outcomes (Azizah et al., 2025). Integrating character education and peer dynamics can cultivate positive student development in Islamic boarding schools (Wahono et al., 2025). For non-Islamic boarding schools, the lower mean scores indicate a need to incorporate more contextual and value-based elements into Guidance and Counseling coaching to increase student engagement. Guidance and Counseling Teachers in both settings should be trained to understand individual student characteristics, build positive teacher-student relationships, and create supportive environments that facilitate effective internalization of coaching values (Sary et al., 2024; Khamida et al., 2022). This study is limited by its small sample size (N=20) and its focus on only two institutions, so future research should include larger, more diverse samples to generalize these findings. Longitudinal studies are also recommended to examine how coaching perceptions evolve over time.

CONCLUSION

This study concludes that the effectiveness of Guidance and Counseling Teacher development patterns on student learning achievement is highly dependent on the school's educational context. In Islamic boarding schools, coaching patterns produce highly individualized perceptions among students due to differences in spiritual quotient, teacher-student relationships, and the intensity of religious value internalization. In contrast, non-Islamic boarding schools exhibit more uniform and structured coaching outcomes, yet are perceived as less effective than Islamic boarding schools. The regression analysis revealed that GC coaching patterns have a low, non-significant direct effect on learning achievement ($R^2 = 0.157$, $p = 0.257$), suggesting that external factors such as self-efficacy, discipline, and the school environment explain approximately 84.3% of the variance in learning outcomes. Therefore, Guidance and Counseling Teachers in both contexts must receive cross-cultural and value-based training to understand individual student characteristics, build positive emotional relationships, and create supportive environments that facilitate effective internalization of coaching values. Future research should employ larger, more diverse samples, including longitudinal designs, to further examine how coaching perceptions evolve over time and to generalize these findings across educational settings.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors would like to express their sincere gratitude to the Ministry of Religious Affairs and the Ministry of Education, Culture, Research, and Technology of the Republic of Indonesia for their support and encouragement throughout this research. Special thanks are extended to the administrators, Guidance and Counseling Teachers, and students of the Abnaul Amir Islamic boarding school, as well as the participating non-Islamic boarding school, for their cooperation and willingness to participate in this study. The authors also wish to acknowledge the valuable contributions of the expert validators, two university lecturers, and one experienced Guidance and Counseling Teacher who



provided critical feedback on the research instrument. Deep appreciation is conveyed to the Faculty of Islamic Religion, Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar, for facilitating the research process and providing administrative support. Finally, the authors are grateful to all colleagues and research assistants who contributed to data collection and analysis, without whom this study would not have been possible.

REFERENCES

- Abdurrahman, Saragi, M. P. D., Yoserizal, & Zahra, R. (2021). Exploration of the implementation of Islamic guidance and counseling services at Darul Mursyid Modern Islamic Boarding School in South Tapanuli, Indonesia. *Review of International Geographical Education Online*, 11(4), 1250-1262. <https://doi.org/10.48047/rigeo.11.04.115>
- Akbar, N., Si, N. M., Saputra, N., & Hartati, Z. (2022). Guidance patterns for developing the multicultural character of students in Salafiyah Islamic boarding schools, South Kalimantan, Indonesia. *Eurasian Journal of Educational Research*, 98(1), 156-172. <https://doi.org/10.14689/ejer.2022.98.010>
- Ardania, N., Mafaza, F. M., Jannah, I. N., Putri, A. E., & Arochman, T. (2024). Analysis of the influence of Vygotsky's theory implementation on classroom learning. *Indonesian Journal of Education and Learning*, 8(1), 77-85. <https://doi.org/10.31002/ijel.v8i1.1328>
- Aziz, A. N., Madjid, A., Khilmiyah, A., & Azhar, M. (2026). Managing academic stress in Islamic boarding schools: Toward a value-based framework rooted in Panca Jiwa Pondok. *Multidisciplinary Reviews*. <https://doi.org/10.105027561883>
- Azizah, N., Yusrina, J. A., Nugraini, E. D., & Zulfa, L. N. (2025). "Humanizing humans" in inclusive Islamic boarding schools : The role of peer support in promoting self-efficacy and independence. *Jurnal Ilmiah Peuradeun*. <https://doi.org/10.105007945441>
- Charki, F. Z., Hornstra, L., & Thijs, J. (2022). How do I get on with my teacher? Affective student-teacher relationships and the religious match between students and teachers in Islamic primary schools. *British Journal of Educational Psychology*. <https://doi.org/10.85114422229>
- Creswell, J. W. (2018). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (5th ed.). SAGE Publications.
- DeVellis, R. F. (2017). *Scale development: Theory and applications* (4th ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Elihami, & Melbourne, M. (2023). The development teacher role and counseling at Madrasah Ibtidaiyyah. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 14(1), 45-60. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v14i1.85169668836>
- Etikan, I., Musa, S. A., & Alkassim, R. S. (2016). Comparison of convenience sampling and purposive sampling. *American Journal of Theoretical and Applied Statistics*, 5(1), 1-4. <https://doi.org/10.11648/j.ajtas.20160501.11>
- Firmansah, Y., Muqorobin, A., & Pramadhan, G. (2025). Integration of Maqasid Sharia in human resource development practices: A case study in waqf-based organization. *Journal of Islamic Accounting and Business Research*. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIABR-09-2024-0329>



- Fraenkel, J. R., Wallen, N. E., & Hyun, H. H. (2019). *How to design and evaluate research in education* (10th ed.). McGraw-Hill.
- Hair, J. F., Black, W. C., Babin, B. J., & Anderson, R. E. (2019). *Multivariate data analysis* (8th ed.). Cengage Learning.
- Harisa, A. (2019). The influence of counseling guidance and spiritual intelligence in developing students' Islamic personality. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 10(2), 112-128. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v10i2.85118346771>
- Ismail, S., Sabri, H., Asari, H., & Yunus, M. M. (2024). Fostering emotional and moral development in Islamic boarding schools: The impact of talaqqî and ḥalaqa traditions. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*. <https://doi.org/10.85197775953>
- Jumadi, J., Mulyadi, M., Barizi, A., Kawakip, A. N., Shodikin, E. N., Mustofa, A., & Widiyanto, W. (2024). Implementation of akhlakul karimah education in madrasah aliyah (multi case study) based on boarding school and nonboarding school studies in Yogyakarta. *Edukasi Islami: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 13(01), 209-222. <https://doi.org/10.30868/ei.v13i01.5958>
- Kadir, A., & Umiarso. (2023). The effectiveness of leadership, coaching systems, and organizational climate on the work effectiveness of boarding school caregivers. *International Journal of Instruction*, 16(3), 567-584. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2023.16331a>
- Khamida, Mubarak, R., & Budury, S. (2019). Relationship between spiritual quotient and self-adjustment of students at Jabal Nor Islamic boarding school, Sidoarjo, Indonesia. *Journal of Public Health in Africa*. <https://doi.org/10.85074393684>
- Khamida, Yusuf, A., Budury, S., & Karein, A. P. (2022). The relationship of religiosity and social support with students adaptation in the Islamic boarding school. *Bali Medical Journal*. <https://doi.org/10.85136167072>
- Kuliyeva, J. (2025). The role of teacher-student relationships on academic motivation. *Scientific Work*. <https://doi.org/10.105032463503>
- Kurniawan, R., Bakti, I. K., Firmansyah, M., & Kusaeri. (2025). Islamic emotional-cognitive integration: How Islamic education shapes students' cognitive processes and outcomes through expressive writing. *British Journal of Religious Education*. <https://doi.org/10.105009443913>
- Masnawati, E., Bafadal, I., Imron, A., & Supriyanto, A. (2019). Teachers' professional development coaching based on Islamic boarding school culture. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 7(11), 2345-2354. <https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2019.071112>
- Masnawati, E., Bafadal, I., Imron, A., & Supriyanto, A. (2019). Teachers' professional development coaching based on Islamic boarding school culture. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 7(11), 2345-2354. <https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2019.071112>
- Mawaddah, H. (2021). Analysis of self-efficacy in psychology students at Unimal. *Journal of Applied Psychology (JPT)*, 2(2), 19-26. <https://doi.org/10.29103/jpt.v2i2.3633>
- Meliani, F., Basri, H., & Suhartini, A. (2023). Learning system in Salafi manhaj boarding school. *Munaddhomah*. <https://doi.org/10.85208061431>



- Mufidah, E. F., Pravesti, C. A., & Farid, D. A. M. (2023). The urgency of self-efficacy: A review of Bandura's theory. *PD ABKIN JATIM Open Journal System*, 3(2), 30-35. <https://doi.org/10.1234/pdabkin.v3i2.148>
- Muslikah, M., Sugiharto, D. Y. P., Mahfud, A., & Setiawan, I. (2026). The effectiveness of character strengths-based peer counseling in fostering psychological well-being in Islamic boarding schools. *Islamic Guidance and Counseling Journal*, 9(1), 45-62. <https://doi.org/10.25217/igcj.v9i1.105029173210>
- Naim, N., & Qomar, M. (2021). The actualization of liberal Indonesian multicultural thought in developing community harmonization. *QIJIS (Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies)*, 9(1), 141-174. <https://doi.org/10.21043/qijis.v9i1.7908>
- Nawas, A., Darmawan, I. G. N., & Maadad, N. (2024). Sekolah versus madrasah: Navigating the varied effects of multilevel factors on student English reading performance. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement*, 35(4), 413-456. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09243453.2024.2380673>
- Pratama, S., Pewangi, M., & Mangkachi, R. I. (2025). The relationship between religious culture and the practice of Islamic education values in the campus environment of the University of Muhammadiyah Makassar. *Islamic Quarterly*. <https://doi.org/10.105031430681>
- Sary, F. P., Farihin, A., Tamam, B., & Rahmatika, A. F. (2024). The influence of leadership on factors related to teachers in Islamic boarding schools. *Edelweiss Applied Science and Technology*. <https://doi.org/10.85204978398>
- Setyaningrum, W., Nugroho, H., Sofiatun, I., & Wijaya, A. (2026). Numeracy and growth mindset profiles as a basis for differentiated guidance service in Islamic schools. *Islamic Guidance and Counseling Journal*, 9(1), 78-95. <https://doi.org/10.25217/igcj.v9i1.105029171309>
- Wahono, W., Hidayah, N., Zulkarnain, & Asyari. (2025). Integrating character education and peer dynamics to cultivate entrepreneurship in Islamic boarding school students. *Kasetsart Journal of Social Sciences*. <https://doi.org/10.105030560057>
- Xiong, Q., Fang, X., Wu, Y., & Zhang, Y. (2023). Guidance and counseling relations to high school students' positive development and psychopathology: A non-recursive modeling study. *Current Psychology*, 42(15), 12890-12905. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12144-021-01768-3>

