

The Use of Questioning Strategy in Promoting Students' Critical Thinking

Annisa Rizqa Rahima¹, Hj. Nurlaila Kadariyah^{2*}, Nor Izzatil Hasanah³

¹ annisasubhan15@gmail.com

² nurlailakadariyah19@gmail.com

³ izhanorhasanah@uin-antasari.ac.id

¹²³ UIN Antasari Banjarmasin

ABSTRACT

Critical thinking is a crucial purpose that the education government wants to focus on to advance the production of quality education in Indonesia. The important role that cannot be separated from this progress is the teacher who is in charge of facilitating the students. Therefore, various strategies are used by teachers in facilitating students' critical thinking, one of which is by using a questioning strategy in class. In this study, descriptive qualitative based on theory was used in a book entitled *Qualitative Data Analysis, A. Methods Sourcebook* by Miles, et al. Furthermore, data analysis uses three stages, namely data condensation, data display and verification conclusion. The subjects of this study were four English teachers at the MTsN 2 Kota Banjarmasin. The techniques of data collection used observation and interviews. The results of this study show that the teachers used all of the types of questioning strategies proposed by Wu such as repetition, rephrasing, simplification, decomposition, and probing strategies in their lessons. And probing strategy was found which is the most chosen in promoting student critical thinking. Moreover, in its use in learning sessions it shows that the teacher actively uses the questioning strategy at the beginning, middle, also end of the lesson. By knowing the questioning strategies used by the teacher it can provide a theoretical description of the types of questioning strategies also an overview of the application of questioning strategies in the classroom used by the teacher in promoting students' critical thinking.

Keywords: English Teacher, Questioning Strategy, Critical Thinking

1. INTRODUCTION

Critical thinking is a skill that all students currently need because many positive benefits can be obtained by thinking critically. Therefore, students are required to familiarize themselves and master critical thinking skills. According to Rashid and Qaisar (2016), in the classroom, critical thinking skill is an important thing that every student must have because the purpose of education is to encourage individual focus and the development of critical pedagogy. Furthermore, it stated that critical thinking also has benefits for the education

itself, including that the particular concerned will become more evaluative in solving problems through their judgment (Aldossari and Aldjani, 2021).

However, in the scope of education, all activities and capabilities related to students cannot be separated from the teacher. Laine et al. (2020) stated that the teacher has an essential role as a mediator, facilitator, and director for their students' learning. Moreover, to promote students' thinking critically, the teacher must transform from the center of learning to become a facilitator and motivator (Novitaningrum et al., 2020). Therefore, the teacher has a vital role in promoting or familiarizing students with critical thinking. Although teachers do not take over all of the control of the learning process, their role as facilitators in the classroom environment is essential.

To optimize this role, the teacher has several strategies for promoting student critical thinking. One of them is using the interaction strategy. According to Xuerong (2012) in Sulistiyorini (2019), the classroom interaction strategy consists of code, emotional, and managerial strategies. The code acts as a teaching medium in the classroom in the interaction strategy. Furthermore, the emotional method is how the teacher conveys the lesson using gestures and humor. At the same time, the management strategy plays a role in choosing topics so that students are active in class. On the other hand, the teacher feedback strategy focuses on student outcomes and performance. At the same time, the important one is the questioning strategy.

The questioning strategy used in the classroom to gather information and gain student interactions also the student's critical thinking. Milawati and Suryati (2019) in Lestari (2021) claimed that the role of questioning strategy in the classroom to promote student critical thinking has proven effective. In conclusion, the teacher's questioning strategy in the classroom is an important thing that can increase student participation and promote students' thinking skills in learning.

Generally, questioning has been approved as an important teaching method for students to participate in the lesson actively. Nashruddin and Ningtyas (2020), cited in Lestari (2021), states that the role of the teacher in asking questions is a way of making students naturally involve themselves in the lesson or the learning atmosphere. Therefore, by asking questions, teachers can stimulate students' word production and guide them to think deeply about the information they get in class.

Meanwhile, the phenomenon of many students taking lessons without understanding the teacher's learning can be indicated as a lack of effort in critical thinking. As stated by

Rosalina and Setiawan (2019) in their research, they suggest that students with less critical thinking skills usually passively receive knowledge from the learning conveyed by the teacher in the classroom.

Several studies have already been carried out a study about this questioning strategy. For example, research conducted by Rashid and Qaisar (2016) showed that the questioning strategy was stated to have a positive role in the critical thinking of Pakistani students. Moreover, Yunion (2020) conducted a study about "Teacher Questioning Strategies During the English Classroom Interaction at the Seventh Grade of Mts Negeri Surakarta II." It showed that teachers use four types of questions in classroom interaction. Meanwhile, Ong et al. (2016) explored the study entitled "Promoting Higher-Order Thinking Through Teacher Questioning: a Case Study of a Singapore Science Classroom." It founds that the teacher's questions have been proven to help students think deeply about scientific subjects, and the teacher's answers to student responses have been demonstrated to strengthen students' conceptual understanding and foster reflective thinking. In summary, the questioning strategy is one of the interaction strategies closely related to students' ability in critical thinking; Moreover, the research has proven questioning strategies delivered by the teacher could improve students' critical thinking.

Based on the previous research above, the researcher has a new sight in current research. The previous studies that have been mentioned only focused on exploring the effectiveness of using questioning to promote students' critical thinking, which used the quantitative method where data collection is carried out by holding pre-tests and post-tests on students. In contrast, in the current study, the researcher uses a qualitative method described in detail. In addition, the previous studies focused on investigating the questioning strategies used in classroom interaction. Meanwhile, the researcher examined the teacher's questioning strategies and types of questioning strategies related to the questions based on Bloom's taxonomy in promoting students' critical thinking.

2. RESEARCH METHOD

This study employs qualitative research. According to Creswell (2014), qualitative is an approach to knowing more about an activity or investigating a phenomenon by interpreting the meaning of the data. In this study, the researcher described what kinds of questioning strategies the teacher used in promoting student critical thinking and explained

how the teacher delivered the questioning strategy including the phase or time of learning. The use of descriptive analysis here is for describing more details and interpreting the meaning of the results of this research because situations in the classroom must be described in detail with appropriate language and factual situations that relate on the result of data collection.

Miles et al. model analysis was used to process and analyze the data received from the research. This analysis was carried out both during and after data collection was completed. According to Miles et al. (2014), activities in qualitative data analysis are carried out interactively and continually until the task is completed. Data analysis has three main activities: data condensation, data display, and drawing and verifying conclusions.

This study used observation and interviews as the primary data collection techniques. The observations were made in two meetings. The data were recorded in an observation sheet also field notes to analyze the questioning strategies in promoting students' critical thinking used by the teachers during the learning process. Furthermore, interviews were conducted with four English teachers consisting of three English teachers in the eighth grade and an English teacher in the ninth grade. Interviews were conducted in one meeting for 20 minutes to support data collection.

3. RESULTS AND ANALYSIS

Based on the results of observations, it is known that English teachers use six types of questions to promote students' critical thinking in class, namely Knowledge Question (KQ), Comprehension Question (CQ), Application Question (APQ), Analysis Question (ANQ), Synthesis Question (SQ), and Evaluation Questions (EQ) the teacher asked various questions to students. The data was collected from the four teachers and two times observations, Meeting 1 (M1) and Meeting 2 (M2). The observation results of the types and frequency the teacher used the questions are shown in the table below.

Teacher	QUESTION TYPE USED												Total
	KQ		CQ		APQ		ANQ		SQ		EQ		
	M1	M2	M1	M2	M1	M2	M1	M2	M1	M2	M1	M2	
A	26	23	8	13	10	7	3	5	-	-	8	8	111

B	20	21	6	7	7	9	11	7	4	-	-	15	107
C	12	24	29	13	8	11	4	4	-	3	10	-	118
D	15	13	8	12	4	5	19	13	-	-	9	7	105

The results of observations with four teachers found that the teachers used all of the types of questions based on Bloom's taxonomy as stated in Brown (2001). As can be seen in the table, the teacher A asked a total of 111 questions, teacher B 107 questions, teacher C 118 questions, and teacher D 105 questions in 2 meetings. Moreover, The questions posed by the teacher have different frequency intensities. It is known that the teachers used 154 Knowledge questions, 96 Comprehension questions, 61 Application questions, 66 Analysis questions, 7 Synthesis questions, and 57 Evaluation questions.

Based on the findings, the probing strategy is a questioning strategy that the teachers use a lot in order to find out how far students understand the material. Moreover, the probing strategy also has been used most frequently in promoting student critical thinking by the four teachers that the researcher observed. According to Omari (2018), cited in Lestari (2021), the probing strategy has an important effect when the teacher poses high-level questions in order to understand student difficulties and also promotes students to have more critical thinking. Therefore, the probing strategy plays a crucial role not only as a determinant of the teacher in assessing students' difficulties in learning or measuring their understanding but the probing strategy also plays a role in promoting students' critical thinking skills. Additionally, it was founded that the repetition strategy is the second largest after the probing strategy chosen by the teacher in delivering questions in class. The teachers mentioned the use of repetition in promoting student critical thinking which acts as a focus and also attracts attention so that students have the opportunity to convey their thoughts.

Moreover, the simplification strategy, which is a strategy that changes the question to be simple and easier to understand, is not often used by teachers. Besides, the researchers found that the teachers often use rephrasing strategies in asking questions. Rephrasing strategies are used to change the content and also the level of questions to be easier because they are adapted to students' abilities to answer and explore their critical thinking. As argued by Gall (1987) in Yuliawati (2016) that questions that are not clear cause students difficulties

in understanding and giving correct answers. Thus, in conveying questions the clarity and understandability must be considered by teachers.

Furthermore, it was found that the use of the decomposition strategy was only used by a few teachers. The teacher mentioned that the use of decomposition strategy can help students to develop their critical thinking and problem-solving skills. According to Rosalina et al. (2019) dividing the question into several small parts is able to make a response based on critical thinking from students. In sum, breaking down complex problems into smaller parts, students can better understand the problem and identify possible solutions.

In this research, it is known that the use of the questioning strategies in the classroom was able to improve students' critical thinking, as said by the teacher who was interviewed said that the questioning strategy has a positive impact on students, besides they become actively involved in learning, they are also directed to think critically. As stated by Bata (2020), the questioning strategy in class has an important role in giving students the opportunity to be involved in learning and also being able to direct them to think more critically. In addition, learning is known to be divided into three main phases. They are pre-activity (beginning of the lesson), while-activity (in the middle of the lesson), and post-activity (at the end of the lesson).

The first session is opening or commonly known as pre-activity. By questioning strategies at the pre-activity stage, teachers can help to activate prior knowledge and to prepare students for the learning that is about to take place. Additionally, questioning can help to engage students and to build interest and motivation for the upcoming activity. This pre-activity, in the view of the teachers, is a crucial stage because it is the initial assessment to enter the material. In addition, in the observations and interviews that have been carried out, it was found that the teachers used a lot of knowledge questions along with probing and repetition strategies with the aim of knowing their knowledge capacity before entering learning. Bata (2020) stated that questions at the beginning of learning are a benchmark in determining student knowledge regarding the material that has been taught.

The second session is while the activity or the core of learning. Questioning in the middle of a lesson is an important part of effective teaching and also can be a powerful tool for engaging students and setting the stage for learning. According to Sujariati et al. (2016), it is claimed that the role of the questioning strategy in this session was not only a way to confirm student understanding but also as a motivator for students to better master the material being studied. In sum, It involves asking students questions that encourage them to

reflect on what they have learned so far and to make connections between different concepts or ideas. Furthermore, in this session, the dominant strategy that the teachers used was the repetition strategy along with knowledge, comprehension, and application question that drilled the students to answer questions and state the right answer to the teacher's question. The teachers mentioned that in the main core activity, students would easily lose focus and cause a lack of attention to learning. Therefore, the repetition strategy is used in order to restore the focus of the students and is able to help students to deepen their understanding and retain the material over time.

The last session is post-activity or the end of the lesson. Questioning at the end of a lesson is an important teaching strategy that can help consolidate students' learning, assess their understanding, and provide feedback for both students and teachers. This study found that teachers mostly used knowledge, application, and evaluation questions at the end of learning. By asking thought-provoking questions at the end of a lesson, teachers can help students reflect on what they have learned, identify areas of confusion or difficulty, and reinforce key concepts. Additionally, probing and repetition strategies were mostly used at the end of the learning session. The teacher mentioned that the use of repetition at the end of learning was able to make students oriented to answer correctly. Meanwhile, the probing strategy is used to get a complete answer from students so that it can be a measurement in determining whether students understand the lesson or whether the material must be repeated again as stated by Lestari (2021) that probing questioning strategies are needed by the teacher in analyzing students' understanding of the material that has been taught.

4. CONCLUSION

This study found that the teacher used all of the types of questioning strategy proposed by Wu (1993) they are repetition, rephrasing, simplification, decomposition also probing strategy. Moreover, probing strategy was the most widely used because the teachers wanted students to express their opinions and assessments throughout this strategy. The students seemed brave to express their ideas and tried not to be shy to tell what they had in mind about the material given. By employing teacher questions based on Bloom's taxonomy and Wu's teacher questioning techniques, students' critical thinking was about to be promoted. Furthermore, the use of questioning strategies in three learning sessions, the beginning of the lesson, the middle of the lesson, and the end of the lesson, have a big impact on the student, especially in their critical thinking ability. The teachers approve; using

appropriate questioning strategies in each session can make learning objectives more optimal. In this study, at the beginning of the lesson questioning most frequently used is repetition also probing strategy with the reason that it is easier to point out the activity before learning. Furthermore, at the middle of the lesson, the most dominant teacher used the repetition strategy with the reason to restore student focus and make sure the material is well received. The last, at the end of the lesson, the questioning strategy most used by the teachers were repetition and probing strategies, with the reason being the use of repetition strategy to be able to make students oriented to answer correctly. For the probing strategi the teachers argued that is used because to get a complete answer from students and be a measurement in determining whether students understand the lesson or the material must be repeated again.

REFERENCES

- Akhdinirwanto, R. W., Agustini, R., & Jatmiko, B. (2020). Problem-based learning with argumentation as a hypothetical model to increase the critical thinking skills for junior high school students. *Jurnal Pendidikan IPA Indonesia*, 9(3), 340-350. <http://journal.unnes.ac.id/index.php/jpii>
- Aldossari, A. T., & Aldajani, M. M. (2021). The effectiveness of a self-questioning strategy at developing academic achievement and critical-thinking skills among secondary-school students in saudi arabia. *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research*, 20(8). <https://doi.org/10.26803/ijlter.20.8.17>
- Ariyana, Y., Bestary, R., & Mohandas, R. (2018). Buku pegangan pembelajaran berorientasi pada keterampilan berpikir tingkat tinggi. *Direktorat Jenderal Guru dan Tenaga Kependidikan Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Hak*. <http://surl.li/gwhzs>
- Astrid, A., Amrina, R. D., Desvitasari, D., Fitriani, U., & Shahab, A. (2019). The power of questioning: Teacher's questioning strategies in the EFL classrooms. *Indonesian Research Journal in Education/ IRJE/*, 91-106. <https://doi.org/10.22437/irje.v3i1.6601>
- Bata, K. W. (2020). Teachers' questioning strategies in Indonesian language learning. in *1st International Conference on Language, Literature, and Arts Education (ICLLAE 2019)* (pp. 67-73). Atlantis Press. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.200804.013>
- Brown, H. Douglas. (2001) . *Teaching by Principle an Interactive Approach to Language Pedagogy*. Longman.
- Creswell, JW (2014). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. Sage.
- Fusco, E. (2012). *Effective questioning strategies in the classroom: A step-by-step approach to engaged thinking and learning, K-8*. Teachers College Press.
- Fitriati, S. W., Isfara, G. A. V., & Trisanti, N. (2017). Teachers questioning strategies to elicit students verbal responses in EFL classes at a secondary school. *English Review: Journal of English Education*, 5(2), 217-226 <https://journal.uniku.ac.id/index.php/ERJEE>

- Hasan, F. (2021). Konsep critical thinking dalam al-quran dan relevansinya dengan pendidikan islam. (*Online Thesis*, Institut Agama Islam Darussalam). <https://tesis.riset-iaid.net/index.php/tesis/article/view/121>
- Hassan Malik Faraj, P., & Al-Noori, B. S. M. (2020). The questioning technique and its role in developing thinking skills: especially productive skills (writing). *International Journal of Research in Science and Technology*, 10(1), 47-52. DOI: 10.37648/ijrst.v10i01.010
- Hitchcock, D. (2020). Critical thinking. In Edward N. Zalta (Ed.), *The stanford encyclopedia of philosophy* (fall 2020 edition). Metaphysics Research Lab, Stanford University. <<https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2020/entries/critical-thinking/>>.
- Laine, A., Ahtee, M., & Näveri, L. (2020). Impact of teacher's actions on emotional atmosphere in mathematics lessons in primary school. *International Journal of Science and Mathematics Education*, 18(1), 163-181. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10763-018-09948-x>
- Lestari, D. R. (2021). The student responses of teacher questioning probing strategies to promote the student critical thinking in classroom interaction. *RETAIN (Research on English Language Teaching in Indonesia)*, 9(3), 77-83. <https://ejournal.unesa.ac.id/index.php/retain/article/view/40344>
- Liu, R. (2022). A research on different classroom questioning strategies between Chinese and foreign EFL teachers. *Journal of Contemporary Educational Research*, 6(6), 1-12. <https://doi.org/10.26689/jcer.v6i6.4008>
- Maba, W. (2017). Teacher's perception on the implementation of the assessment process in 2013 Curriculum. *International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities (IJSSH)*, 1(2), 1-9. <https://doi.org/10.29332/ijssh.v1n2.26>
- Miles, M.B, Huberman, A.M, & Saldana, J. (2014). *Qualitative Data Analysis, A. Methods Sourcebook, Edition 3*. Sage Publications.
- MR, E. R. (2016). Teachers' perceptions toward the use of English textbook. *English Education: Jurnal Tadris Bahasa Inggris*, 9(1), 43-54. <https://doi.org/10.24042/ee-jtbi.v9i1.418>
- Muharam, D. A. M., Munandar, A., & Sriyati, S. (2019). Utilization of the school environment as a learning resource to improve critical thinking skills and scientific attitudes. In *Journal of Physics: Conference Series* (Vol. 1280, No. 3, p. 032003). IOP Publishing. DOI 10.1088/1742-6596/1280/3/032003
- Novitaningrum, A., & Lestari, L. A. (2020). Teachers' questioning strategies to promote students' critical thinking in EFL classroom: perceptions and practices. *International Journal for Educational and Vocational Studies*, 2(1), 53-59. <https://doi.org/10.29103/ijevs.v2i1.1977>
- Ong, K. K. A., Hart, C. E., & Chen, P. K. (2016). Promoting higher-order thinking through teacher questioning: a case study of a Singapore science classroom. *New Waves-Educational Research and Development Journal*, 19(1), 1-19. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1211406>
- Parman, P., Nurwahida, N., & Syam, A. (2020). Questioning strategies analysis: teachers' practice and students' view. In *The Second International Conference on English Education*. <http://iconelepbi.uinalauddin.ac.id/index.php/iconele02/iconele02/paper/view/117>
- Pasa Marasita, G., & Srijono, D. (2021). Teacher's questioning strategies and students' response in teaching compliment at the tenth grade of sma muhammadiyah 2

- surakarta in 2019/2020 academic year (*Doctoral dissertation*, Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta).
<http://eprints.ums.ac.id/id/eprint/94194>
- Paul, R., & Elder, L. (2019). *The miniature guide to critical thinking concepts and tools: eight edition*. Rowman & Littlefield.
- Phan, N. P. T., & Nguyen, H. B. (2021). Teachers' perceptions of questioning as pre-teaching stage in general english classes. *European Journal of English Language Teaching*, 6(5). DOI:10.46827/ejel.v6i5.3873
- Putri, D.Y., & Reflinda. (2021). Teacher's questioning strategies during the classroom interaction at islamic senior high school. *FOSTER: Journal of English Language Teaching*, 2(4), 499-514.
<https://media.neliti.com/media/publications/394012-teachers-questioning-strategies-during-t-f04331d5.pdf>
- Rashid, S., & Qaisar, S. (2016). Developing critical thinking through questioning strategy among fourth grade students. *Bulletin of Education and Research*, 38(2), 153-168.
<https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1210303>
- Rasna, I. W., Binawati, N. W. S., & Putra, I. N. T. A. (2020, May). The harmony in instructional communication to create a comfortable learning atmosphere. In *4th Asian Education Symposium (AES 2019)* (pp. 102-105). Atlantis Press.
<https://dx.doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.200513.023>
- Richards, J. & Lockhart, C. (2007). *Reflective teaching in second language classrooms*. Cambridge University Press. <https://id.id1lib.org/>
- Rosalina, I., & Setiawan, S. (2019). The questioning techniques used by foreign-educated teacher to promote critical thinking. *Jurnal Education And Development*, 7(2), 81-81. <https://doi.org/10.15642/ijet2.2019.8.1.1-10>
- Setianingsih, R., Marianti, A., & Ngabekti, S. (2019). Analysis of critical thinking skills high school students in the district of semarang material environmental change curriculum 2013. *Journal of Biology Education*, 8(3), 315-321.
<http://journal.unnes.ac.id/sju/index.php/ujeb>
- Shanmugavelu, G., Ariffin, K., Vadivelu, M., Mahayudin, Z., & Sundaram, M. A. R. (2020). Questioning techniques and teachers' role in the classroom. *Shanlax International Journal of Education*, 8(4), 45-49.
 DOI:<https://doi.org/10.34293/education.v8i4.3260>
- Shihab, M. Quraish. (2011). *Tafsir Al-Misbah: Volume Ketiga*. Lentera Hati.
- Suartini, N. K. T., Wedhanti, N. K., & Suprianti, G. A. P. (2021). Teacher's questioning strategies in junior high school: a case study. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris Undiksha*, 8(2), 97-103.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.23887/jpbi.v8i2.31063>
- Sujariati, S., Rahman, A. Q., & Mahmud, M. (2016). English teacher's questioning strategies in EFL classroom at SMAN 1 Bontomarannu. *ELT Worldwide: Journal of English Language Teaching*, 3(1), 107-121. <http://surl.li/gwhzs>
- Sulasmiati, M., Prastiwi, C.H.W., Rahmawati, I.O. (2021). Teacher and students' perception in online teaching and learning english during corona pandemic. *EDUTAMA*, 1(1), 1-9
<https://ejournal.ikipgribojonegoro.ac.id/index.php/JPE>
- Sulistiyorini, L. (2019). An analysis of teacher interaction strategies: a case study in english massive program in Kediri. *Language-Edu*, 8(1).
<http://riset.unisma.ac.id/index.php/LANG/article/download/2423/2305>

- Syarifah, S. (2017). *Metode tanya jawab dalam al-Qur'an (kajian tafsir surat al-Anbiya 7, al-Qari'ah 1-2, al-Baqarah 28, at-Takwir 26-27, ar-Rahman 13, al-Baqarah 245* (Bachelor's thesis, FITK UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta). <http://repository.uinjkt.ac.id/dspace/handle/123456789/33861>
- Wu, K. Y. (1993). Classroom interaction and teacher questions revisited. *RELC journal*, 24(2), 49-68. <https://doi.org/10.1177/003368829302400203>
- Xuerong, F. (2012). Excellent English teachers' classroom strategies: A case study of three college English teachers in China. *Higher Education of Social Science*, 2(1), 1-7. DOI: 10.3968/j.hess.1927024020120201.2115
- Yuliawati, Y., Mahmud, M., & Muliati, M. (2016). Teacher's questioning and students' critical thinking in EFL classroom interaction. *ELT Worldwide: Journal of English Language Teaching*, 3(2), 231-247. <https://doi.org/10.26858/eltww.v3i2.2261>
- Yunion, P. Rafika & Giyoto, M. (2020). Teacher's questioning strategies during the english classroom interaction at seventh grade of mts negeri surakarta II in academic year 2019/2020 (*Doctoral dissertation*, IAIN Surakarta). <http://eprints.iain-surakarta.ac.id/191/1/Rafika%20Yunion%20Skripsi.pdf>
- Zulkifli, H. & Hashim, R. (2019) The development of questioning skills through *hikmah* (wisdom) pedagogy. *Creative Education*, **10**, 2593-2605. doi: 10.4236/ce.2019.1012187